

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 225 412

FL 013 462

AUTHOR Gordon, Helen Heightsman
TITLE Controlled Compositions: More Practice for Students, Less Grading for Instructors.
INSTITUTION California Association of Teachers of English to Speakers of Other Languages.
PUB DATE 82
NOTE 9p.; In its: "CATESOL Occasional Papers," Number 8, p.88-95, Fall 1982; Paper presented at the CATESOL State Conference (Monterey, CA, May 1981); For related documents, see FL 013 455-463.
PUB TYPE Speeches/Conference Papers (150) -- Guides - Classroom Use - Guides (For Teachers) (052)
EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *English (Second Language); Second Language Instruction; Teaching Methods; *Writing (Composition); *Writing Exercises; *Writing Instruction

ABSTRACT

The use of controlled compositions as a method of providing writing practice for English as second language (ESL) students is described. The method requires students to copy well-written short compositions while changing each one a meaningful way, such as from present to past tense or singular to plural. Thus, students at all levels or ages can learn through practice in context, imitating good writing while manipulating selected aspects. Controlled compositions are less time consuming to correct than original compositions but provide more than isolated drills. In a pilot course using controlled compositions, students showed significant gains in fluency and reduction of errors. The controlled composition method effectively applies current composition theory to writing instruction by providing positive models, immediate feedback, and opportunities for successful experiences. Because they can be graded quickly, they free the instructor to spend more time on original compositions. Sample exercises are presented. (RW)

* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS
MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

CATESOL

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES
INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

California Association -
Teachers of English to
Speakers of Other Languages

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION
CENTER (ERIC)

X This document has been reproduced as
received from the person or organization
originating it.

Major changes have been made to improve
reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this docu-
ment do not necessarily represent official NIE
position or policy.

CATESOL Occasional Papers
Number 8 (Fall, 1982)

CONTROLLED COMPOSITIONS: MORE PRACTICE FOR STUDENTS
LESS GRADING FOR INSTRUCTORS

Helen Heightsman Gordon
Bakersfield College

Teachers of English as a second language have some problems in common with all English teachers, particularly the problem of reconciling the students' need for more writing practice and the instructor's limits of time and energy. In addition, the ESL teacher faces a greater problem in developing fluency in student writing. Grammar alone does not do the trick; students need more holistic writing practice. How do we provide this practice without burning ourselves out grading papers?

A partial answer lies in the use of controlled compositions. This method is suitable for a wide range of student abilities. Able students enjoy it, but it is also effective with the insecure ones, those who are unfamiliar with English idioms, those who do not analyze well, and those who can't think of anything to say. There are also some students it does not appeal to--those who think that only drills are "English" and those who dislike having to rewrite careless work. But for students who stick with it, some remarkable progress can be made in fluency and correctness.

The Method

Here's how the method works. Students copy well-written short compositions, changing each one in some meaningful way, such as from present to past, singular to plural, slang to standard English, and so on. Or they may combine selected sentences within the composition to form appositions, compound sentences, adjective clauses, adverbial clauses, etc. They learn the appropriate punctuation in context as they make these changes. In effect, they are playing the game in order to learn the rules, much as a beginning piano student plays simple tunes

This paper was presented at the CATESOL State Conference in Monterey, May, 1981.

ED225412

FL 013 462

to start:

Basically, controlled compositions are a means of learning to write by imitation, but they are not mindless copying. The student must manipulate the passages thoughtfully, but he or she can concentrate on just one concept at a time. Thus even the student who has had repeated frustration can write a perfect paper.

Students should copy the entire passage, not just cross out and replace words. In this way they develop fluency, a sense of continuity, and proofreading skills. If students make more than three errors on one controlled composition, they should re-do at least those sentences in which the errors occur. Even better results can be obtained by re-doing the whole paper to get a perfect copy, because this task resembles revision tasks in the world of work. However, students should not have to re-do an exercise more than once. They should move on to a more difficult assignment.

Grading of controlled compositions is quick and easy. The instructor quickly becomes familiar with each exercise and can scan it in the student's presence. By merely circling errors and asking the student to explain what's missing or wrong, the instructor encourages him to edit his own work. Tutors or student aides can also be trained to grade controlled compositions with a key. In some instances, more than one response may be acceptable. The grader should accept any response that makes sense, even if it differs from the suggested version in the answer key.

This method has limitations, of course. It should be supplemented by such methods as free writing, journal keeping, sentence combining, clustering, and original compositions. Once students have been exposed to the good writing in controlled compositions, however, their original writing improves as they draw upon the patterns and structures they have absorbed.

Effectiveness of the Method

To test the effectiveness of controlled compositions in reducing mechanical errors and increasing fluency, a pilot course in basic writing was conducted at Sacramento City College in fall, 1978. Although the class was a remedial course, students ranged in ability from some who were eligible for regular freshman English to those who were learning disabled. All made measurable gains. The achievement of these students over a semester was compared to that of a carefully matched group who studied traditional sentence structure. The two groups were

comparable in entrance exam scores, high school English grades, age range, sex ratio, and number of foreign students enrolled. Both groups were taught by experienced and dedicated instructors.

The experimental group used thirty controlled compositions, sequenced according to difficulty, along with free writing and the writing of sentences from stimulus words (clustering). As measured by essays on uniform topics at the beginning and end of the semester, students in the experimental group reduced their mechanical errors by 43 percent and increased fluency by 17 percent. The traditional students, in contrast, reduced their errors by only 15 percent and did not increase fluency at all. In fact, they wrote, on the average, 10 percent fewer words than they had at the beginning of the semester. All instructors involved considered the gains of the experimental group to be significant (not statistically significant, however, because the sample was not randomized). Further details of this research may be found in the author's doctoral dissertation, "A Comparison of Fragmented and Holistic Modes of Instruction in Remedial Writing," ERIC document CCM000134.

Applications of the Method

The applications of this method are as variable as students themselves. Elementary teachers can select short passages from books their students can understand, or write short ones dealing with the world they live in, and have the students manipulate them in various ways. Adult education teachers might choose subject matter dealing with practical life or consumer affairs. Instructors in vocational and technical programs could select material of special interest to their students. Instructors of students with a low self-esteem can select materials from self-help books with a strong "can do" flavor. Following are two samples of controlled compositions in the last category.

Sample exercise No. 1 -- Writing About Men and Women

DIRECTIONS: Rewrite the passage below in your own notebook. Change it so that it describes a woman instead of a man. Put a box around each of your changes, proofread the whole paper to be sure it makes sense, and then see your instructor or aide to compare your paper to the answer key. Pronouns you will need to change are underlined. Your first sentence, when changed, will read like this:

The healthy personality is a person who likes herself.

The Healthy Personality

The healthy personality is a person who likes himself. He likes other people and accepts their faults as well as his own. He acts naturally, without pretending to be anything he is not. He prefers to face an unpleasant reality rather than retreat to a pleasant fantasy. Usually his behavior is like that of his friends, but he can be different if necessary. His moral values are the highest; he wants justice and fairness for all people. Being alone is no problem for him, and he stays true to his beliefs even when others seem to be against him.

He feels a sense of belonging to mankind as a whole, so he does not discriminate against people because of race, social class, or religion. When he sees an injustice, he is likely to speak out against it. Although he enjoys the company of others, he is not dependent on them. Close friends of his make up a comparatively small group, but their relationship to him is deep, meaningful, and lasting. He has tender love for children. And, like a child, he sees the world freshly; he can appreciate again and again the beauty in ordinary things--a sunset, a flower, a baby, a person.

Sample exercise No. 2 -- Practice in Using You Consistently

DIRECTIONS: Rewrite this passage in your own notebook. Change it from a formal passage using "one" and "he" to an informal passage using "you" forms. Be consistent all through the paper. Put a box around each change you make, proofread the whole paper to be sure you have been consistent, and see your instructor to compare your paper to the answer key. Your first sentence when changed, will look like this:

if you are hypnotized and told that you are at the North Pole, you will not only shiver and appear cold, but also develop goose bumps.

The Secret of Hypnotic Power

(Adapted from Psycho-cybernetics,
by Maxwell Maltz)*

If one is hypnotized and told that he is at the North Pole, he will not only shiver and appear cold, but also develop goose

*Reprinted with permission of Prentice-Hall, Publishers.

bumps. The same amazing thing happens if he is told to imagine that one hand is being held under ice water; his temperature will drop in that hand. When he is convinced that the hypnotist's statements are true, he behaves differently because he thinks and believes differently. When he is convinced that he cannot feel pain, he can even undergo surgery without an anesthetic.

He acts and feels, not according to what things are really like, but according to the image his mind holds of what they are like. He has certain mental images of himself, his world, and the people around him, and he behaves as if these images were true.

If one sees himself as clumsy, he will behave in clumsy ways. If he sees himself as a poor speller, his spelling will surely be poor. On the other hand, if he believes he can learn, he will work at learning and succeed at it. Whether he thinks he can or cannot do something, he is right.

Composition Theory and Professional Literature

The controlled composition method effectively applies current composition theory. It is an appropriate technique for the "new student" who prefers to learn by doing rather than through abstract theory.⁽²⁾ It provides the much-needed practice recommended by Shaughnessy (14), Sykes (15), E'Elola (3), Lunsford (10), and many others. More important, this kind of practice provides positive models in a context, not just isolated drills, and yet it works toward the correctness which students themselves desire.

As an alternative to grammar and usage drills, controlled compositions make a positive contribution. Although the general public seems to believe that students' writing deficiencies can be cured by such drills, this belief flies in the face of a substantial body of research. Summarizing over fifty years of this research, Dunning and Sledd (4) listed several "knowns" leading to the recommendations by the National Council of Teachers of English for teaching writing:

1. That isolated drills in usage, formal grammar, phonics, and spelling have little value. These skills are best learned in a context.
2. That most students learn to write and read by performing real tasks: writing letters, notices, stories, reports for a class audience, etc.

3. That drills may be useful following diagnosis of weakness in a specific area, but not as a substitute for whole writing tasks.
4. That students need help during the writing process.
5. That sentence building is more productive than analysis or labeling.

Similar conclusions may be drawn from the third National Assessment of Writing, a federally financed effort to measure writing performance in the nation's schools between 1969 and 1979. Of the broad sampling of nine, thirteen, and seventeen-year-old students, most had a grasp of grammar and punctuation but showed weakened ability to write persuasively and with sophistication (12). These findings were interpreted as an unfortunate by-product of the back-to-basics emphasis upon simple skills. By using controlled compositions, however, the instructor can follow the recommendation of N.C.T.E. and also assist students in developing style.

Copying as a means of learning style was a much-utilized method in the Eighteenth Century, and many practitioners are now recommending its revival. William Gruber (8) reported amazing improvement in his students' writing through "servile copying" of the style of Mark Twain and other writers. Daniel Fader (5) also advocated copying in his 1976 book The New Hooked on Books. He told an anecdote about a youth in a detention facility who had "nothing to write about" for his journal, but when allowed to copy Time Magazine for six weeks, improved not only his writing but his participation in social studies classes. Edward Corbett and Barrett Mandel (11) suggest that copying model passages allows students the experience of producing mature prose without consciously conceptualizing it first-- in other words, bypassing the analytical left hemisphere of the brain and experiencing insightfully with the right hemisphere.

Research on brain hemisphericity by Brandwein and Ornstein (1) and others is giving us insight into why holistic methods of instruction work. The left hemisphere controls language, rational cognition, sequential concepts, and analysis of details. The right hemisphere controls intuitive thinking, spatial perceptions, holistic and generalizing perceptions. Hunter (9), Sperry (15), Samples (13) and Galin (6) point out that education (especially in reading and writing) rewards left-brain activities more than right-brain ones. They plead for greater symmetry in development. Because controlled compositions permit the holistic imitation of patterns as well as accurate perception of details, they teach to both halves of the brain.

Commercial Materials

For those instructors who do not have time to write and select their own controlled composition materials, some commercial materials are available. A pioneer in the field is Kunz and Viscount's Write Me A Ream, (Teacher's College Press, Columbia University), an inexpensive supplemental set of exercises designed for adult education. More recent works are two from Holt, Rinehart, and Winston--Friedmann and MacKillop's The Copy Book (1980) and Gordon's From Copying to Creating (1981). Friedmann has extensive exercises and suggestions for original compositions suitable for college students or advanced ESL adults. Gordon includes some sentence-combining and a handbook for correcting the most common errors, in addition to sixty controlled compositions suitable for college, adult education, or high school students. Two books from Language Innovations, Inc., of New York are designed especially for ESL students: Ten Steps, by Brookes and Withrow, provides 61 model passages for beginning and intermediate ESL students, and Twenty-six Steps, by Kunz, for intermediate and advanced students, 53 passages.

Although controlled compositions will not render unnecessary the writing of original compositions, they do provide a useful kind of writing practice. Because they can be graded in a minute or two, they free the instructor to spend more time on the students' original compositions. They are sound in theory because they provide positive models, immediate feedback, and opportunities for repeated success experiences.

References

1. Brandwein, P., Ornstein, R. "The Duality of the Mind." The Instructor, January, 1977, 86, 54-58.
2. Cross, K. Patricia. Beyond the Open Door. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, Inc., 1971.
3. E'Eloia, Sarah. "The Uses--and Limits--of Grammar." Journal of Basic Writing, Spring/Summer, 1977, I 1-48.
4. Dunning, S. and Redd, V. "What are the Basics in English?" Slate (N.C.T.E.), August, 1976, I, 1-2.
5. Fader, Daniel. The New Hooked on Books. New York: Berkeley Publishing Company, 1976.

6. Galin, David. "Educating Both Halves of the Brain." Childhood Education, October, 1976, 53, 17-20.
7. Gordon, Helen H. "A Comparison of Fragmented and Holistic Modes of Instruction in Remedial Writing," doctoral dissertation, ERIC #CCMOO0134, April, 1979.
8. Gruber, William E. "Serve Copying and the Teaching of English Composition." College English, December, 1977, 39, 491-497.
9. Hunter, Madeline. "Right-brained Kids in Left-brained Schools." Today's Education, November-December, 1976, 66, 15-48.
10. Lunsford, Andrea A. "What We Know--and Don't Know--About Remedial Writing." College Composition and Communication, February, 1978, 29, 47-52.
11. Mandel, Barrett J. "The Writer Writing is Not at Home." College Composition and Communication, December, 1980, 31, 370-377.
12. Roderick, Kevin. "U.S. Students Make Some Gains in Writing Skills, Study Finds." Los Angeles Times, January 16, 1981, Part 1, 3.
13. Samples, Bob. "Educating for Both Sides of the Human Mind." The Science Teacher, January, 1975, 42, 21-23.
14. Shaughnessy, Mina. Errors and Expectations. New York: Oxford University Press, 1977.
15. Sperry, Roger W. "Left-Brain, Right-Brain." Saturday Review, August 9, 1975, 30-33.
16. Sykes, Shirley. "Let's Have Them Write." Inside English: Journal of the English Council of California two-Year Colleges, December, 1980, 7, 1-8.